

# **Human Trafficking: A Study Exploring its Causes, Current Efforts and Challenges**

**A Thesis Submitted for the Partial Fulfilment of  
Master's Degree in Development Studies**

**By  
Disha Ranjana  
Roll No- 413HS1001**

**Under the Guidance of  
Dr. Bhaswati Patnaik**



**Department of Humanities and Social Sciences  
National Institute of Technology  
Rourkela – 769008, Odisha, India  
May 2015**

## **DECLARATION**

I hereby declare that I have completed my project on “**Human Trafficking: A Study Exploring its Causes, Current Efforts and Challenges**” at National Institute of Technology, Rourkela, Odisha in the academic year 2014 – 2015. The work submitted here by me is true and original to the best of my knowledge.

**Disha Ranjana**  
**M.A. in Development Studies**  
**Dept.: Humanities and Social Sciences**  
**National Institute of Technology, Rourkela**

**Dr. Bhaswati Patnaik**  
**Associate Professor (Psychology)**  
**Department of Humanities and Social Sciences**  
**National Institute of Technology**  
**Rourkela – 769008**  
**Odisha, India**

**Date: 11.05.2015**  
**Rourkela**

### **CERTIFICATE**

This is to certify that **Ms. Disha Ranjana** has carried out the research embodied in the present dissertation entitled “**Human Trafficking: A Study Exploring its Causes, Current Efforts and Challenges**” under my supervision for the award of Master’s degree in Development Studies at the National Institute of Technology, Rourkela. This dissertation is an independent work and does not constitute part of any material submitted for any research degree or diploma here or elsewhere.

**(Dr. Bhaswati Patnaik)**

**Research Supervisor**

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

*I would like to extend my deepest gratitude towards my supervisor Dr. Bhaswati Patnaik for having confidence in me and encouraging me; it truly has been a rewarding experience.*

*This gratitude is also extended to all the faculty members of the Department of Humanities and Social Sciences without whose guidance this research would not have been possible.*

*I would also like to thank my friends for believing in my work and abilities.*

*My heartfelt appreciation goes to my interviewees who took time out of their busy schedules for participating in this research.*

*A special thanks to my seniors and friends Aradhana Panigrahi, Nivedita Pathak, Medha Rath and Yashaswi Agarwal for motivating me to finish the project by helping me at every hour with their presence. Lastly, I would like to thank my parents, whose unconditional love and support inspired me to use my gifts of compassion, mercy, and sensitivity to help others in need.*

*Disha Ranjana*

<i>Declaration</i> .....	<i>I</i>
<i>Certificate</i> .....	<i>ii</i>
<i>Acknowledgement</i> .....	<i>iii</i>
<i>Abstract</i> .....	<i>viii</i>
<b>Chapter 1- INTRODUCTION AND LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>1-24</b>
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Background of The Study .....	4
1.3 Review of Literature.....	6
1.4 Research Gaps.....	19
1.5 Conceptual Framework.....	20
1.6 Rationale of the study.....	21
1.7 A brief profile of Sundargarh district.....	22
1.8 Objectives of the study.....	24
<b>Chapter 2- METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>25-26</b>
2.1 Sample.....	25
2.2 Tools.....	25
2.3 Procedure.....	25
<b>Chapter 3- RESULTS AND ANALYSIS</b>	<b>27-36</b>
2.4 Results.....	27
2.5 Analysis.....	27
(A) Human Trafficking and its Prevalence in Sundargarh.....	27

(B) Causes for the prevalence.....	28
(C) Current efforts to combat Human Trafficking.....	30
(D) Challenges faced while combating Human Trafficking.....	30
(E) Case Studies of the Trafficked victims.....	30
(F) Role of NGOs in combating Human Trafficking.....	33
<b>Chapter 4- CASE STUDIES</b>	<b>37-49</b>
2.1 A case of domestic servitude (Female).....	37
2.2 A case of domestic servitude (Male).....	41
2.3 A case of sex trafficking.....	43
2.4 A case of group trafficking.....	46
2.5 A case of Transnational Trafficking.....	48
<b>Chapter 5- DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUSION</b>	<b>50-55</b>
2.6 Limitations of the Study.....	51
2.7 Implications of the Study.....	52
2.8 Direction for future research.....	53
2.9 Recommendations.....	54
<b>References</b>	<b>56-59</b>
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>60-61</b>

## **ABSTRACT**

Human trafficking is a multifaceted issue which requires a multidisciplinary approach. This study is aimed at exploring the causes, current efforts and challenges faced in this context. The objective of this study is to examine the incidence of human trafficking and its underlying factors in the Sundargarh district of Odisha. Sundargarh is an industrially expanding district which can open up employment opportunities for the tribals who are immensely affected due to various reasons. To analyse the experiences of the victims of human trafficking, indepth case study method has been adopted. Finally examining the role of local NGOs in combating human trafficking is a major thrust in this study. The sample of the study includes five (5) case studies of the trafficked victims. The respondents also included the members and staff of the NGOs, different officials of the district administration and family members of the victims. The results indicated that an inclusive approach is what India needs in order to combat trafficking. These approaches should be right-based because Human Trafficking violates human rights. So every endeavour should be directed towards protection of these rights. Protection measures should be directed to both men and women. The study reveals how the state rehabilitation programs do not function as they should be. Monitoring and evaluation of anti-trafficking programs should incorporate methods to get accurate field based data. Above all, alternate livelihood options should be made open to the tribal population who are not skilled otherwise.

Key words: Trafficking, human rights, rehabilitation, convergence, inclusive

## CHAPTER I

### INTRODUCTION AND REVIEW OF LITERATURE

This chapter aims at introducing the topic “**Human Trafficking: A study exploring its causes, current efforts and challenges.**” by emphasizing on its definition and the relevance of the study in the Sundargarh district of Odisha. It gives a general idea about Human Trafficking. This chapter deals with review of literature to throw light upon the issue in Sundargarh district of Odisha. It also includes the research gaps, conceptual framework, and definition of the key terms, rationale of the study, and a brief profile of Sundargarh and finally the objectives of the study.

#### 1.1 INTRODUCTION

An intergovernmental impromptu body was established in December 1998 by the United Nations General Assembly and was bestowed with the responsibility of devising a legal system which would combat transnational organized crime. This ad-hoc body finally completed the work that was assigned to it in October 2000 after 120 states had assembled for eleven times. The main feature of this new legal framework was the ‘Convention Against Transnational Crime’. There were three pacts which were an adjunct to this Convention. These pacts dealt with *Smuggling of Migrants*, *Trafficking in Persons -- Especially Women and Children*, and *Trafficking in Firearms*.

A conference which was held at Palermo, Italy in December 2000 opened the Convention to be signed by member states. Because the General Assembly had already espoused these three adjunct pacts in November 2000. In an international context it is seen that, Vienna process can be accredited for initiating the fight against the evil of worldwide organized crime (Gallagher, 2001).

Henceforth, the definition of Human Trafficking was quoted. United Nations' Palermo Protocol defines Trafficking in person as, "the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation should include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organ." (United Nations, 2000).

UNDOC's first endeavour towards classifying human trafficking from among the pool of other forms of organized crime was done in April 2006 (Chawla et al., 2009). Prohibition of all forms of Trafficking is also stated under Article 23 of the Indian Constitution. Other acts which have been instrumental in combating human trafficking were passed after the International Convention of the Suppression of Immoral Traffic and Exploitation of Prostitution of Others in 1950 (India) were authorized. These acts were The Suppression of the Immoral Traffic Act 1956 (SITA) which got amended to the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act (ITPA) in 1986 (Nair & Sen, 2005). It has become a serious issue of the twenty first century because of rapid globalisation, industrialization, urbanization and related migration patterns which are forcing people to move from one place to another in search of livelihood options and employment opportunities.

The general idea that we carry about human trafficking is equivocal and vague. Human trafficking and people smuggling are not the same thing. There are marked differences between these two concepts. The central facet to these concepts is the motive behind exploitation (Iselin & Adams, 2003).

Trafficking must have some essential elements to be fully defined as trafficking. An 'action' is important which is to be done through some 'means' and must be directed towards some 'goal(s)'. The varieties and ways in these elements vary from situation to situation. Without these elements, human trafficking cannot be said to have taken place (Aronowitz, 2009). The perils of both trafficking in person and human smuggling cannot be ignored because each has different consequences. The source of both human trafficking and human smuggling can be traced back to the varied forms of migration (Salt, 2000).

It can be seen that migration, human trafficking and human smuggling have a nexus amongst themselves. They thrive on mutual elements which are functional in these phenomena. The 'consent' element is taken into account in context of trafficking and human smuggling (Kyle & Koslowski, 2011). Victims of both phenomena are exploited. In case of migration, people who avail the services of a smuggler outside their own conscious knowledge, often find themselves turn into victims of trafficking. Another prime difference between people smuggled and people trafficked is that the former have the freedom to leave their place of work or operation and the latter are not even remotely fortunate to do the same (Väyrynen, 2003). This is how one phenomena leads to another and thereby creating a nexus. Human trafficking is a profit making business worldwide.

Traffickers make lump sum amount of money at the cost of the lives of innocent people which consists of babies, young girls, children, women, men (Orhant & Murphy, 2002). They are exploited and deprived of their freedom and human rights. People who get victimised are forced to work without pay (Kangaspunta, 2011). The incidences of human trafficking generally flourish due to the marginalised people who are frail, poverty stricken and helpless due to the absence of livelihood options which makes them susceptible. Gender discrimination and related exploitation is another major reason for these marginalised people suffering and bearing the cost of exploitation. Their lives can be transformed when better and

sustainable livelihood opportunities would be created for them. In some countries where there is a situation of war, military base camps serve as the demand driven group and are facilitated by sex workers who have been trafficked from different regions (Getu, 2006).

There is an urgent need to study human trafficking, especially in the district of Sundargarh, Odisha because of the ambiguity in the number of reported and unreported cases.

Trafficking in person is a multifarious issue which is in dire need of an approach which can address every aspect of it. Therefore while studying every aspect of human trafficking in India, the socio economic conditions of the people must be taken into account.

The colossal concern for trafficking in persons, human smuggling and transiting migration patterns are quite ahead of what is normally perceived by the local news, media, governmental and non governmental bodies. Their opinion advances further than that of academic research and published statistics (Salt, 2000). It is extremely hard to gauge the size of trafficking because it is almost identified as any of the forms of forced labour (child), prostitution, abduction etc. It must be noted that these can have a separate identity to them and should not be merged with Trafficking, to avoid confusion. The human rights of women and children are exceedingly misused and exploited when they fall victim to any kind of trafficking.

Therefore, it is very important to adopt an approach which would be multidimensional. This would ensure that at least the major aspects are going to be addressed to and shall be dealt with (Ghosh, 2009).

The consequence of such multifaceted studies would aid policy formulations and implementations in order to combat human trafficking and human smuggling. The outcomes may be fruitful or may create more scope for further research in this context.

## **1.2. BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY**

Getting an idea of what exactly HUMAN TRAFICKING is demands a lot of perspective. This is because every case and situation of human trafficking is unique in its own course. To substantiate this, in a general case of human trafficking it is seen that a person (who later on becomes the victim) is taken from their village or town or city to another place, based on false promises of employment in a promising sector (commonly domestic help or labourer) with a handsome pay. Now this pay is made to look more than what this person gets in his/her own region. Such lucrative deals are the base or the main reasons for trafficking to start off in a region in the first place. Nevertheless when they arrive at the destination, what welcomes them is a shock of reality. They either never get the job that they were promised in the first place. The pay that they were promised is below their imagination. And from thereon, the situation starts deteriorating. In many cases it is unacceptable. They are handed over to placement agencies where they are further sent to different houses as domestic help and to different industries for different kind of small scale labour jobs. Initially if we see this situation is that of human smuggling. But since the recruiter makes misleading promises, this case is moulded into the shape of human trafficking.

In transnational trafficking, it is commonly seen that those people who are taken away from their home country in the pretext of being given good jobs, their passports are taken away from them. And other such related personal documents are confiscated (Shelley, 2007). There is no escape for these victims. They are held as hostages are drowned in huge debts which can cost them their lives, if they ever tried to escape.

Therefore whilst giving a global perspective to Human Trafficking calls for understanding the concept of it as well as educating civilians as to how they must recognize and respond and tackle the traffickers and trafficking happening in their communities and

periphery. It is very important even for students of social sciences to open their eyes and broaden their perspectives and vision about human trafficking in a global arena. Identifying these intricate details of the dynamics of human trafficking is much more important than just haphazardly going forward with new laws and policies or whatsoever.

### **1.3. REVIEW OF LITERATURE**

Most of the literature which is accessible to public was widely based on the outcomes of research studies conducted, newspaper articles, minutes of conferences and workshops that are held pertaining to human trafficking. These conferences and workshops are generally organised by national and international NGOs and government bodies.

The American Psychological Association (2011) established the Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls and reported that there are different aspects to human trafficking apart from legal, social and human rights. Different recommendations regarding the enhancement of training and research in this field of human trafficking and also for changes in public policy, advocacy set up, capacity building and preventive measures to be taken for combating the same were suggested. Scientific approach has been used to have an insight for the psychologists to deal with this social problem. Because if the dynamics of trafficking are not well understood, the picture that we get is vague and lacks clarity about the real issue. In the policy recommendations section, it has been suggested that behavioural health services and counselling services should be given to those who have been the victims and then came out as survivors and also to be able to generate enough funds to have further in-depth research in this field. It is important to promote and create awareness in the sectors like education, health, legal (judiciary) and child welfare and train their professionals about the various aspects, elements and consequences of human trafficking. The main inclusion was about the study of mental health as a part of human trafficking studies. So appropriation of

resources and services is important. Policies should be based on evidence and shouldn't lack credibility. Incorporating appropriate programs for girl's safety as victims and survivors in the system of juvenile justice is also important. It is recommended that the school curriculums should have enough information about how effectively they (both teachers and students) can identify those at risk for trafficking as well as be aware of the consequences. These should also include appropriate materials as to how they should be empowered and fortified to recognize coercive and non-coercive relationships to be able to tackle this problem. These materials should suffice the need to encourage youth turn down false promises, based on which they are usually taken into the vicious circle of trafficking. There should be more clarity regarding the misinterpretations about the whole concept of human trafficking and regarding the identification of those who get or are trafficked lest it be confused with the different patterns of migration.

Hameeda (2010) reported that, the dynamics of Trafficking in India was very much multifaceted in nature. The efforts for prevention of trafficking by NGOs, donor agencies, government needed more intervention and with better recommendations. Through this qualitative study it was seen that these recommendations were properly implemented by The Asia Foundation in India for combating Human Trafficking. A detailed analysis of the Indian legal framework was done thoroughly. It is seen that the legal framework is highly blemished in India. The reasons which have flawed the legal framework are massive corruption which is deep seeded, overstrained judiciary system which is as slow as a snail and the weak safety services which is almost non-functional. The major flaw of the legal machinery is the improper or almost no-implementation of the laws which are formulated for the prevention of trafficking and criminalization of those (it includes the trafficker, the agents, the perpetrators, the buyers, the profiteers) who are the culprits. Deterring trafficking becomes difficult due to

these loopholes in the judicial system where, when the laws are implemented then the penalties are not severe enough.

Skeldon (2000) studied that, trafficking is an essential business and showed its difference from human smuggling in context of Asia and how things are relevantly perceived. There is a clear distinction between human trafficking and human smuggling because there is usually a lot of confusion between these two phenomena. The major reason for this confusion is the lack of clarity in the definition of borderlines of these regions and there is a lot of conflict over these regional borderlines. Owing to these confusions, there are many numbers of refugees, immigrants and similar groups crossing borders. Labour trafficking is a normal sight in Asia. And it is maximum in the regions which are already industrialized or are in the transitional phase of industrialization. Such regions and countries over all need to formulate appropriate laws and regulations so as to protect the labourers who are exploited and victimised. Subsequently, the culprits should also be brought under the books of the judicial system. The legal distinctions and moral perspectives are unclear and vague when the meaning of both human trafficking and human smuggling is probed into. It analyses the different kind of factors pertaining to risk for those who are trafficked and for those who could become victims if proper security isn't provided to them. The course of trafficking is determined by the path the traffickers follow and also in connection to lax border control. Good riddance from trafficking cannot be achieved unless we have a clear idea about it and the aspects involved. The academic institutions which work in the field of research are also provided with some recommendations to make amends and to exemplify their research with proper techniques and tools. Expanding the area of research by such academic institutions is also necessary. Delving into different topics which are crucial in studies of human trafficking are; the routes of trafficking, the size and demographics of the organizations or bodies involved in trafficking, examining the risk factors involved and the estimated number of

people affected by this, the amount of cash in-flow and out-flow and the pattern too and finally the effectiveness of the different laws in the country should also be analysed. The gaps in the formulation and implementation of these laws should also be bridged via efficient security stratagems.

VanImpe (2000) discussed the outcomes of a study of trafficking which was conducted between Philippines and Belgium. It edges over the need for a multidimensional approach to devise methods to deal with this menace of trafficking in persons (especially women). There are multiple causes which act upon and finding an all encompassing solution becomes a difficult task. The amalgamated effect of these causes cannot be curbed by simple measures. Instead what is more crucial is to have amendments in the judicial thread, so that the incidences can be kept low. These causes should be uprooted by exercising and implementing such legal reforms which secure the rights of the victimized people by correcting lax border rules and by mapping the pattern of illegal and legal movements. There is also a need for consensus among the regions which serve as source, transit and destination for better implementation of these measures. These reforms and regulations at the application stage should be synced with each other.

Miko and Park (2003) investigated that how inclination, favouritism and differential treatment towards boys and men generally seen in almost every society is a major reason for trafficking. This is where we know that patriarchy prevails and thus aggravates the situation for women who are adversely affected and exploited in every possible manner. There are many factors which renders human trafficking. Lack of effective legal machineries, bestiality of legal enforcers and dysfunctional institutions administering the states and regions where prevalence of trafficking in persons is seen, are some of the factors. Most countries lack these machineries. India is one of them. Even if there are legislations, they are not implemented as they should be. These are the major hurdles in the face of prevention of human trafficking.

Women subjugation is seen in almost every community and society worldwide. Culture can be accredited for such behaviour of men towards women. They remain superior and keep bashing women in the name of culture. The indicators of human development see a lot of difference in almost all countries. The second and third world countries see huge gaps in their life expectancy index, poverty and inequality index and economic indices etc. Access to education, livelihood options, right to property and inheritance and good health facilities are very limited for women and girls. These factors push women towards a pit of uncertainty and thus render vulnerability which leads to their exploitation. Development induced displacement, illegal migration, wars and conflicts between states and regions and sub regions also put such women in a situation of jeopardy. There is an illustration in this study where it is seen that when the communist ruling in Eastern Europe crumbled, there was an increased rate of illegal activities thereafter and the nexus of anti social agents also started expanding. Such situations aggravate the susceptibility of these marginalised people. Therefore it is seen that political, social and economic institutions and their transitional evolution has a major impact on the trends and incidences of human trafficking. Nevertheless these institutions play a vital role in reducing the effects too.

Fowler & UNICEF (2004) illustrated the different segments a country gets divided into, pertaining to the ways the traffickers carry out their transactions, in context of Africa. Their role in carrying out these transactions (involving people from the marginalised section of the community) also characterises the patterns and the classifications made. It is seen that those countries which supply (involuntarily) people for the purpose of meeting the demands of traffickers and their clients, are known as the country of source. This is more evident in the third world countries who are deprived, poverty stricken, lack ample amount of livelihood and employment opportunities, characterised by low levels of literacy, health and where inequality prevails. And those countries where the victims are taken to area known as the

country of destination. Likely the country through which the victim is taken is known as the country of transit. The victims of trafficking are transported through these regions. The countries of destination are the ones who create the demand for such people thus forcing and increasing the number of trafficked victims every year. It can also be applied to the regions (states and districts) in a country where trafficking prevails.

Huda (2006) claims that, apart from health ramifications, sex trafficking goes beyond the limits of human rights violation. The outcomes of the cruel treatment of the victims, is reflected in their status of physical, sexual and psychological health. The cost borne by these people are a cluster of health perils which might include an obsession of drugs and increased dependence on them. Sexual health gets impaired due to reasons like STDs (sexually transmitted diseases), unintended pregnancy leading to abortion in most cases, health complications, and different forms of physical and sexual abuse like rape. The mental health of an individual is adversely affected pushing them to their limits, with an increased propensity towards mental instability and suicide.

Kilgman and Limoncelli (2005) illustrated examples of trafficking in persons, especially that of women in various countries. They analyzed that human trafficking isn't a new thing for the academicians, national authorities, media persons and development professionals. This concept is not an alien subject to them. They mentioned about the transiting nature of trafficking patterns in the last one century. Nonetheless the stability of their organizational foundation and structural roots remained almost similar to that of ancient times. Countries like China, Japan and many European nations served as country of source in the past. This note is of late 19<sup>th</sup> century and early 20<sup>th</sup> century. There was a wave of change with the advent of industrialization which was noticeable globally. This because the population had started to multiply due to urbanization, frequent emigration and immigration between countries and political revolution also had significant role to play in the increased

incidences of women and girls trafficking. Women and young girls from France, Poland and Italy were being forced into the flesh trade in European nations, Argentina and Brazil. In the eastern world, women from China and Japan were pushed into prostitution in Britain, Hong Kong, Singapore, Shanghai and Malay regions. This was the scenario after socialism had started fading away. These trafficked women were of service to men of different nationalities who were wage workers, military personnel, business man and even powerful people like politicians. Gradually this took the face of a new business idea as it made huge profits. For the case of Eastern Europe, it was seen that when communism crumpled in the year 1989, new avenues opened up for those who got more intensely involved in the flesh trade. In the context of Human Trafficking it is seen that prostitution is a proliferating trade.

Gupta et al. (2011) critically analyzed the probable measures which contribute to the increasing danger of HIV infection amongst those who have survived sex trafficking in India. 61 case studies of those women and girls were taken for in depth analysis that were trafficked for sexual activity and then rescued and sent back home. These women and girls were benefiting from the services of an NGO in Mysore. Case study analysis was done to find the prime roots and causes of the dangerous HIV infection which made their lives miserable. The women and girls who were the respondents of this study belonged to the age group of 14-30 years. They were made to take the HIV test. Out of 48 women and girls who took the test, around 45.8% were HIV positive. They were more susceptible because of lack of freedom to do things on their own. They were under strict restrictions and boundations, which seems to have increased the propensity of this crime. HIV infection was prevalent among them because of their susceptibility and also due to the repeated rapes, coercion acts, limited access to protective measures, health care and their sheer incapability to refuse such abuse due to their bonded situation. These were particularly the outcomes of the study. On a concluding note, it was seen that these trafficked women and girls were dependent on others and thus

were susceptible to HIV infection via these mediums. Hence, it is suggested that there is an essential need for preventive measures to decrease the prevalence of HIV infection among these women and girls who get trafficked.

ILO (2005) studied about the preconceived notions about the employment of those who are trafficked into different industries. The study states that the people, who are trafficked, due to coercion, trick, bondage, false hope and sham marriages don't always get into prostitution. There are various other kind of sexual enslavement. They are put into laborious factory and industry based jobs. Mostly kids are a part of the begging racket where they are forced to go into the streets. Young girls and even women are sold off in the name of marriage and forced into domestic servitude also. All of these things are studied in the context of South Asia. Recent estimates from ILO's study shows that, of all victims 43% are sexually exploited, 32% are victims are economically abused and exploited.

Dinh et al. (2014) invited a proposal comprising innovative and dynamic methodologies with an intention to develop the base and expand it for further research in Human Trafficking in Vietnam. It is an organized crime and is on the rise. It can also be called as the modern day slavery. The outcomes of the pilot study that was conducted in the rural regions (hamlets) of Vietnam have been focussed upon to find reliable and relevant statistical data which is usually not available. To overcome this issue, the pilot study was a requisite and to find a solution to this. The revelations of this survey were that the researchers did not find any trace or reliable information to confirm as to why rural population saw more trafficking incidences. It was not necessary that the rural places only had the maximum number of trafficked victims. This is because even urban population and those people residing close to borders also showed the same tendency. Two areas of similar kind of socio economic backdrops showed different patterns. One area seemed more vulnerable than the other. This survey was about finding the reasons and answers to these

questions. Ultimately the survey resulted in showing that the number of trafficking cases had decreased since 2006. Though this decrement was steady, the problem still prevailed.

Panda (2013) opined about the mobility that is there among the tribal populace. The two districts in concern here are Khordha district and Sundargarh district of Odisha. Both these districts have varying migration patterns. Therefore the focus was on finding out the gender based feature and course of mobility to better explain trafficking in persons. It was found that the tribal women from Sundargarh district were mostly employed as domestic helps in places like New Delhi. And those from Khordha district were seen working as wage labourers in the stone crushing sites which are found along the highway which connects Mumbai and Chennai. They also went to Pipili and nearby villages to work as wage labourers. This stark difference seen between these two districts states that Khordha has opportunities to livelihood access and Sundargarh doesn't. This is why tribal girls from Sundargarh district are mostly trafficked and those from Khordha district are not. The tribal women from Khordha know what might or might not happen if they step out of home and work. But same doesn't happen in Sundargarh district, when they go to places like New Delhi, they are unaware of the challenges that lay ahead of them. On a general note it is seen that both men and women are mobile. This mobility is also a form of trafficking when it's particularly women who are mobile and that too for exploitive tasks. The demand is ever growing for gender specific workforce.

Shetty (2012) studied that development induced displacements is a major reason for the alarmingly increasing number of trafficking cases in Odisha. When people from the tribal populace get displaced due to the execution of developmental projects, they are forced to migrate. While migrating, some people fall prey to the traffickers who take immense advantage of these situations. Since the development projects and their numbers are increasing in Odisha, the increasing number of people trafficked becomes a pressing issue.

This paper studies about the impact of displacement on tribal women and children. Children after displacement get into the bonded labour force if they are unfortunate and get trafficked. Whereas women and girls are mostly employed as domestic help if they are unfortunate and get trafficked. In spite of governmental planning which has been continuing since the last 6 decades, the situation isn't getting any better. On the reverse, it is getting worse for the tribal communities. It is because development is seen as an economic approach. The social, educational, health, nutritional aspects are not taken into the purview when the policy makers formulate the policies. Even the schemes that are made are not tribal friendly.

Tumlin (2000) inferred that to curb trafficking in persons, there needs to be more work directed towards South and South-East Asian countries. There is a need for appropriate intervention programmes and a change in the perspective too while addressing this issue. It was seen that gender specific trafficking in persons is increasing. Boys are being trafficked more for labour intensive activities and are sexually exploited too. So there should be inclusive measures while formulating policies. Implementation of the laws and regulations is very important. Therefore, there need to be an approach where researchers should go beyond the ordinary intervention plans. Focus must be on devising alternatives to keep both girls and boys glued to their land and not be carried away by deceptive, false promises of traffickers. There should be vast studies conducted in these regions of South Asia and South-East Asia where the case studies form the basis. This shall help the researchers and policy makers to create effective measures and make sure that they are implemented properly. Income-generation plans should be strengthened. This overview was all about bringing in better for the people who were trafficked or have been trafficked, to lead a better life.

Bohl (2010) critically study about human trafficking in Nepal and India and throws light on the structural and institutional factors which contribute to its propensity in both the countries. Failure of developmental strategies leads to loss of jobs and also breeds

unemployment everywhere. This in turn forces people to look for livelihood opportunities in anywhere possible. Resource mobilisation is also seen to be defective. Both the countries have seeds of patriarchy sowed deep, which have fed the culture threads to discriminate women in all spheres. This is where they are worst affected. Relying on social networks to benefit themselves for obtaining work to feed themselves and their families proves harmful in the long run. One major finding was that the trafficker is usually someone whom they know. Sometimes parents unknowingly push their children into the vicious circle of trafficking. Relatives play a major role in aggravating this problem further. In Nepal, many children are seen to have been trafficked by their parents when they were sent to work at the Indian Circuses. Maiti Nepal is an NGO working rigorously by formulating trafficking combat programs. They also run shelter homes for re-establishing the rescued victims of trafficking in a new order. Because going back home is not easy as there is less acceptance for labelled people in their communities and societies.

Doezema (2002) investigated the challenges around utilizing the idea of 'consent' for defining the concept of Trafficking in persons (TIP), especially in the context of women. A thorough assessment of the latest dialogues around the UN Trafficking Protocol has been done. The idea of 'consent' or 'assent' was a very debatable theme at the discussions held at the conferences. Many views came from different women centred groups. They contended that all sexual activities where women were employed at ought to be viewed as trafficking in spite of they having given their consent or not. Another women activist body asserted that 'coercion' was a necessary component so as to suffice the meaning of Trafficking. The final effort in this article was to find a consensus between these different bodies who were trying to have a triumph over their position. This article takes varied perceptions from these debates to get a clear idea of the concept of 'consent' by making a contrast study with the ideas from the times of White Slavery which was rampant in the middle of 20<sup>th</sup> century. Ensuring

security and protection to those who have migrated and those trafficked becomes a difficult task on part of the government of a nation. This is primarily because of the policies that are formulated on basis of vague definitions of ‘migration’, ‘trafficking’ and the concept of ‘consent’ attached to these processes.

Friebel and Guriev (2004) believe that incidences of trafficking has shot up due to the incentives put forward by the traffickers to the vulnerable section of the society. They have limited access to credit sources forces them to remain within the boundations of those who lend money to them for supporting their families. This also applies to those who are illegally immigrated to one place from another.

Basu and Chau (2004) asserted that debt creates a bondage situation where people are forced to stay as proletariats under the exploitation of the money lenders. Generally it is seen that children are made to offer their labour as service for such bondages. And this vicious cycle of debt and bondage labour among children is a never ending process. This is seen to get passed from one generation to another which eventually contributes to labour based trafficking. Therefore, assessment of trade permits and endorsements must be made mandatory as policy measure to combat bonded labour.

Richards (2004) analyses the mutual connection between corruption and trafficking and how they feed each other at every level. This connection has two sides to itself, one where it heightens the danger faced by those who get trafficked. The other side is, it makes trafficking smooth, as a process to function without interruptions and any hurdles. This is substantiated by the way the allocated resources are utilized for this process. Nothing but corruption helps it to grow.

#### **1.4. RESEARCH GAPS**

Research on human trafficking is important in Sundargarh district of Odisha because there is a rise in the incidences of trafficking. It is an industrial district and there is rampant migration which is not checked as it should be. The victims of trafficking, when rescued are not rehabilitated in the shelter homes or short stay homes which is designed by the state mechanism. There is no accurate data from field with the correct number of trafficked people. All the vulnerable areas and tribes of the district are not covered during any research study that is conducted by local NGOs, the state government, civil societies or any research institutes due to lack of resources and field knowledge. The attitude of the district administration and state administration is not favourable to bridge the research gaps and to seek insight of the problem. All of these accumulate into one whole and thus the research gaps exist.

## **1.5. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**

Every study has a conceptual framework, which helps in giving clarity to the cause. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime is a custodian of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (UNTOC). It also aids in the implementation of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, which is also known as Trafficking in Persons Protocol. Paragraph (a) of the Protocol's article 3 has defined Human Trafficking in three contexts namely, the act of trafficking, the means through which trafficking is carried out as a process and lastly the purpose of human trafficking for which it is carried out. This study is based on this definition of the United Nations. There are other definitions of different other bodies though. Since migration and trafficking are mostly confused with each other. To avoid this kind of ambiguity, only one definition has been used as a background for this study. The 'act' of trafficking talks about what is done. The 'means' of trafficking talks about how it is done. The 'purpose' of trafficking talks about why it is done.

The different element of human trafficking which comes under this particular definition is illustrated in the table below.

ACT	MEANS	PURPOSE	• TRAFFICK
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• RECRUITMENT</li> <li>• TRANSPORT</li> <li>• TRANSFER</li> <li>• HARBOURING</li> <li>• RECEIPT OF PERSONS</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• THREAT OR USE OF FORCE</li> <li>• COERCION</li> <li>• ABDUCTION</li> <li>• FRAUD</li> <li>• DECEPTION</li> <li>• USE OF POWER OR VULNERABILITY</li> <li>• GIVING OF PAYMENTS OR BENEFITS</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• EXPLOITATION INCLUDING,</li> <li>• PROSTITUTION OF OTHERS,</li> <li>• SEXUAL EXPLOITATION</li> <li>• FORCED LABOUR</li> <li>• SLAVERY OR SIMILAR PRACTICES</li> <li>• REMOVAL OF ORGANS</li> <li>• OTHER TYPES OF EXPLOITATION</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ING IS SAID TO HAVE TAKEN PLACE WHEN ALL THE ELEMENTS OF ACT, MEANS AND PURPOSE ARE PUT TOGETHER.</li> <li>SUMMATION OF THESE ELEMENTS CAUSES TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS.</li> </ul>

(SOURCE:www.unodc.org)

## **1.6 RATIONALE OF THE STUDY**

The review of the existing literature on human trafficking illustrated that though quite a number of studies have been held in the western countries to understand the status and causes and consequences of human trafficking but the number of such studies is limited in India and especially very inadequate in the state of Odisha. It was important to take interviews of rescued victims of human trafficking to get a detailed idea of their journey from source to destination. It was also very important get an idea of the people working with the local NGO who work for the prevention of Human Trafficking in the district of Sundargarh. It is an industrially flourishing district, due to which there is an increased demand for labour. Most of the people who get employed in the district itself are skilled labourers and the ones who don't are usually trafficked to other states.

The number of cases of tribal girls and boys trafficking is growing with the turn of every year. Women and girls face inhumane torture, physical abuse, sexual abuse, mental abuse within the vicious circle of trafficking. People who bait them into this are none but their own relatives and friends in most cases. Violence of any kind is a silent killer of the hopes, aspiration and well being of these unfortunate people. They fall prey to false promises and their all around development is curbed in every manner. They are not aware of their own people who are out there to take advantage of them. The promises seem very beautiful initially and they are fancied by such lucrative offers. Their foresight is blinded by these flashy things and they are not aware of the consequences. It has to end if they are empowered. There should be alternative livelihood opportunities devised for them, so that they won't be forced to step out of their homes and be victimized in this manner. Hence, it becomes very vital to look into the cause of these innocent people falling prey to the traffickers. It is said that "to solve a problem one must reach its roots". Accordingly solutions can be conceived, which would suit them. Because most of these people are from the tribal

areas, they are uneducated and deprived of basic facilities. They are rarely aware of the ways they can deal with such problems. Due to the dearth of proper functional institutions at the grass root level, it becomes all the more difficult to address these problems. Thus, the ultimate aim is to bring down these incidents of human trafficking by finding the root cause and striking at it with the most appropriate solution to reduce their occurrences. Along with this, the role of NGO should also be highlighted upon and the gaps persisting should be bridged. It is important to encourage people participation at the grass root level when any solution to their problems is being formulated.

The consequences of human trafficking in Sundargarh district is an area where much thrust has not been given in the earlier studies. Most of the past studies dealt with the statistics of this district and lacked case study approaches. The district rehabilitation centres are not properly functional and generally they refuse to take in victims of trafficking. Sometimes, the cases of trafficking are portrayed as that of sexual exploitation and domestic violence. Very few studies looked into the specificity of this problem in the context of Sundargarh district. This study is aimed to get a gestalt of the status of trafficking in the district, an in depth analysis of the behaviour of the victim, police, state and the community as a whole along with the role of NGO in prevention of this menace while suggesting ways to bridge the gaps that persist.

## **1.7 A BRIEF PROFILE OF SUNDARGARH DISTRICT**

Sundargarh is the second largest district in the state of Odisha as it accounts for 6.23% of the total area of the state. It was constituted on the first of first of January in the year 1948. Sundargarh has 43% of its total area covered with forest and is inhabited by various tribes. They constitute for about 64.74 % of the total population of the district. A lot of mining prospective is seen in this district because of its regional boundaries with two Indian states

and adjacent districts. These two Indian states are Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh and Jharsuguda, Sambalpur, Angul and Keonjhar districts of Odisha (Census, 2011).

Sundargarh accounts for a total area of 9712 SqKms according to the Census Report of 2011. A total population of 2,093,437 reside in the district of Sundargarh, out of which male and female were 1,061,147 and 1,032,290 respectively. The rural population is 1,355,340 out of which, male population is 676,068 and female population is 679,272.

The sex ratio in the rural areas is 1005 females per 1000 males. Child sex ratio in the rural areas is 966 girls per 1000 boys. About 13.65% of the total rural population is constituted by the children itself. In the age group of 0-6yrs, total male population was 92,292 and females was 89,190 and together they were child population of 181,482 in total.

As per 2011 Census data, the average literacy rate in the rural pockets of the district was 66.63% and out of this, male literacy rate was 75.63% and 57.73% for the female literacy rate. The total literates were 782,147 out of which 441,493 were male literates and 340,654 were female literates.

## **1.8 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY**

1. To examine the incidence of human trafficking and its underlying factors in Sundargarh district of Odisha.
2. To examine experiences of the victims of human trafficking through in depth case studies.
3. To examine the role of local NGOs in combating human trafficking.

## **CHAPTER II**

### **METHODOLOGY**

#### **2.1. SAMPLE**

This study includes an in depth analysis of 5 case studies of the victims of human trafficking the respondents also consisted of workers belonging to the NGOs which are functional in anti-human trafficking activities in Sundargarh district. The case study also covered information from the families of the victims.

The study also includes secondary sources of data like newspaper articles, books, reports, files and records of the NGOs contacted.

#### **2.2. TOOLS**

A quantitative design for this research study was used which included “Purposive sampling technique” with open ended questions in it. This was particularly done to get an insight into the lives of the rescued victims. (See appendix i)

The open ended questions revolved around the perspectives of the NGO workers and the obstacles that they faced. Face-to-face interview method was used. (See appendix ii)

#### **2.3. PROCEDURE**

##### **Data Collection**

The entire data collection took four months for the second and third objective and the same was done in two phases. In the first phase, the interview of the NGO workers was taken. The collection of first objective’s data from the secondary sources had begun since the beginning of the study. It was done to gain information about the scale of the incidences of human trafficking throughout Sundargarh. The crime records of the trafficking in persons were referred to along with other relevant books and journals to assemble the essential information. And in the second phase, the interviews of the rescued victims was done. In this phase the names of the rescued victims were collected from CHILDLINE, Sundargarh and

they were contacted over phone and messengers (for those who had no telephone access).  
After all of these things, preliminary arrangements were done.

### **Data Analysis**

Quantitative data were compiled from different sources for meaningfulness.

### **Types of Data Required**

In order to fulfil the first objective, data on incidences of human trafficking at the National, State and Sundargarh district level was required.

For the second objective, information on the entire journey of the rescued victims in form of case study was required.

Finally for the third objective, information about the role of the NGO- DISHA, working in Bisra block of Sundargarh district was required. Along with this, an important point on the remedial measures to bridge gaps and to prevent trafficking in persons was required.

### **Sources of Data**

For the first objective, secondary data were needed. So they were taken from the internet (books, reports, e-newspapers).

For the second and third objective, primary data was required which was taken via face-to-face interviews (rescued victims, NGO worker).

## **CHAPTER III**

### **RESULTS AND ANALYSIS**

#### **3.1 Results**

The survey was about addressing three issues which formed the basis for the major three objectives. To carry forward with the survey work, relevant information was collected from CHILDLINE Sundargarh office. CHILDLINE India Foundation (CIF) is the nodal agency of the Union Ministry of Women and Child Development which is responsible for the functioning and supervision of the CHILDLINE 1098 provision available in India. CHILDLINE India Foundation is an exclusive organisation which is accredited for the foundation of CHILDLINE provision in every region of India. This provision connects the governmental bodies of states and regions along with the corporate bodies. Any issue related to children are looked into at the CHILDLINE centres (CIF, n.d.).

#### **3.2 Analysis**

##### **(A) Human Trafficking and its Prevalence in Sundargarh**

To study the prevalence of Human Trafficking in Sundargarh district secondary data was required. These data were available with the CHILDLINE Sundargarh centre who is actively involved in anti-child trafficking activities in the district.

An estimate made by the Department of Health and Human Services, USA and the U.S. Department of State says that around 600,000 to 800,000 people get baited by the traffickers and end up as victims of human trafficking by crossing international borders. The estimate says that more than half of these numbers are children.

According to the CHILDLINE Sundargarh records, in the year 2012, there were 37 cases of trafficked girls from the district. About 17 of them were rescued and repatriated. Out

of 37 girls, 24 of them were taken to New Delhi for purposes like domestic servitude. 3 girls each were taken to Jalandhar and Goa and 1 girl each to Pune, Bangalore, Mumbai and Gurgaon. 24 out of 37 girls were below 18yrs of age, 4 girls were above 18yrs and 6 girls were 18 yrs when they were trafficked. All the girls belong to tribal families.

The reported cases of trafficked girls and boys to the CHILDLINE, Sundargarh is 28 girls and 10 boys in total in the years 2013 and 2014. Out of these, 19 girls have been rescued and 9 girls are still missing. Out of 10 boys, 3 boys have been rescued and 7 boys haven't been rescued yet.

There is only one Child Welfare Committee (CWC) in the district which plays a major role in child protection. It was seen that CHILDLINE usually is informed whenever any girl goes missing and then they facilitate their rescue operation with the help of district police personnel. There are 17 blocks in Sundargarh district and only 5-10 blocks are aware of CHILDLINE and thus the amount of cases reported are about 2-3% and rest others go unreported. A local NGO Pragati conducted a study covering 263 villages, 71 gram panchayat in 11 blocks of Sundargarh district. The study showed that around 43,707 females were subjected to trafficking during the last 10years. Furthermore, it was found that 723 females were still missing and 345 of them were sexually exploited and abused.

### **(B) Causes for the prevalence**

There are many causes which creates a fertile ground for trafficking to take place in Sundargarh district. It is tribal dominated and people are mostly illiterate.

Sundargarh has many industries and displacement is a consequence which the people face. This leads to trafficking of the vulnerable people when they are inappropriately resettled or mostly when they are not rehabilitated in the first place.

Women have limited access to education which essentially limits their opportunities to get skill training to be employed anywhere. Domestic abuse and violence sometimes play a vital role in forcing them to step away from home seeking independence and unfortunately fall prey to traffickers.

For male trafficking, it was seen that the perceived idea of men being the bread winner of the family forces young boys to step out of their homes to earn a livelihood. This renders them to work as bonded labourer or fall prey to labour traffickers.

Poverty is a prime reason and most common among the tribal population. People are deprived from their essentials and basic needs for their survival. This eventually forces them to look for better opportunities elsewhere and thus increases their vulnerability.

Community attitude towards people whose children are not employed forces them to accept any opportunity that comes their way in order to earn a livelihood.

Similarly, it was seen that when young girls are not married, their parents are keen on disposing them off to whosoever is ready to take them away in exchange of some meagre amount. Girls and their parents from these rural pockets of the district fall prey to trafficking under the guise of sham marriages.

Every person has the right to look for better living conditions. Disparities in economic conditions of the people from the rural areas always forces them to migrate to other places. There are no proper records of migration and this gives a golden opportunity to the traffickers to take a chance and make money. People from Sundargarh migrate to nearby states. This is easily substantiated because Sundargarh is bordered by 3 states.

### **(C) Current efforts to combat Human Trafficking**

Presently Sundargarh has only one CHILDLINE service to cater to the needs of children related issues like that of Child Trafficking. There are two local NGOs namely DISHA and PRAGATI who work towards curbing human trafficking in the district. The rehabilitation facility available are that of two shelter homes, Swadhar and Ujwala which are not functional to their fullest. Integrated Anti-Human Trafficking Unit (IAHTU) is also functional at 12 locations in the State.

### **(D) Challenges faced while combating Human Trafficking**

There are great many challenges faced by each and every stakeholder. In the context of local NGOs who work towards combating human trafficking in the district face various kinds of barriers which are challenging. This is discussed in the third part of this chapter under the heading “Role of NGOs in combating human trafficking”.

### **(E) Case Studies of the Trafficked victims**

To gain deep insight into the life experiences of those people who were trafficked and then rescued, case study was incorporated. Each case is unique in its own. The details of the case studies are separately found in the next chapter. They show a dearth of employment and livelihood opportunities for these tribal girls which forces them to go outside the state to earn a living for themselves and their families. The other reasons include illiteracy, lack of awareness, hunger, and poverty. These can be attributed as the major reasons of trafficking. Even though, Sundargarh is an industrial district, yet there is lack of opportunities for the resource poor populace of the district.

The case studies emphasized on the fact how the family fails in helping to secure the lives of their children (both girls and boys), because they are poverty stricken and thus

rendered helpless in such situations. They highly depend on money lenders who exploit them. Similarly Friebel and Guriev (2004) had put forward a theory that victims of trafficking do not have access to alternative credit source, which forces them to rely on people who eventually traffic them outside their own region on the basis of false promises. This so happens that, these innocent tribal people offer their labour as services in return for the money they borrow to support their living. Many times it is seen that the money lenders exploit the innocent tribal girls and also are seen involved in trafficking them across states. It is a process, where the vicious circle never ends. The girls, who get trafficked, due to debt bondage, end up as traffickers themselves in order to free themselves and that never happens. Similar findings have been reported by Basu and Chau (2004), who asserted that debt creates a bondage which takes the face of trafficking in the long run.

Many other minute details also play a vital role and contribute to trafficking. Lack of nutrition indicates stunted growth of human brain which doesn't allow them to think rationally when they are being allured into this vicious circle. The failure of Public Distribution System (PDS), the social environment, the concept of kitchen garden and high dropout rate are also a part of this rung. In every social system, these aspects are connected to each other. One failure in any of these aspects leads to failure of the whole system. Escaping this cycle of poverty, abuse and exploitation is not going to be easy for these girls. It is evident from the case studies that poverty and the vulnerability of the tribal girls acts as a 'push factor' towards getting trafficked and the 'pull factor' is the scope of employment on basis of which a trafficker manages to take them away from their habitat.

Similarly, Wheaton et al (2010) inferred that the marginalised sections of third world countries have very limited access to the facilities which are available for them. The institutions that should be working towards their development are inadequate and lack resources. Due to these reasons, the people get easily swayed away and fall prey to these

promiscuous traffickers. The political structure, social framework and the economic foundations, if unstable, create havoc in the lives of these people. Owing to the demands of these superior power vested people, the vulnerable sections from the marginalised communities give in. They are more than forced to work for very meagre amounts of pay in return for their labour so as to feed themselves and their families. This is because of the ever increasing demand for cheap labour. Though it is seen that trafficking contributes to the economy of a nation at the cost of exploiting the human rights of innocent people.

In one of the case studies it is seen that a minor girl was rescued in the state of pregnancy. The consequences were very harsh for her. She fell prey to the demands of those people who want a free rider and pay less for more work like that of domestic servitude. This is the mentality prevailing in the minds of those who act as agents, traffickers, clients of these people, the pimps and the racket owners. These people are morally deprived, profit oriented and inhuman in their approach. On the pretext of getting her a domestic help job, she was taken into the hell of sex trafficking. Huda (2006) claims that sex trafficking has taken a toll and is gaining momentum day by day. It also involves sex tourism which engulfs regions of south East Asia and countries like Japan, Nepal, Thailand, and Vietnam etc. These generally serve as destination countries where the trafficked women and girls are transported to and then further put into tyrannical jobs. Such factors provide for huge amounts of monetary returns and this essentially drives powerful people to exploit the weaker sections of the society. This is one of the reasons why traffickers exploit innocent tribal girls. This applies to the prevalence of trafficking in the district of Sundargarh.

Bales (2007) acknowledges that diminishing mammoth levels of corruption in the governmental bodies, pulling down the growth rate of country populace and bringing about equity in the distribution of social wealth among all the sections of society is a pre requisite to bring down the level of trafficking incidences. In one of the case studies it was seen that

the police helped in rescuing the girl and was instrumental in getting her compensation. In another case study it was seen that the police accompanied the boy back to his native place. These are the good sides of the state behaviour. Those very persons were trafficked via railways and in this context the railway police force had failed when they were taken away. They failed in identifying the traffickers when they managed to take away the girls from under their nose.

In the group trafficking case it was seen that the man who was accused (the trafficker) went scot free in the end because he and his father had connections with the police officials and higher authorities. This reflects how corruption feeds trafficking. Corruption needs to be uprooted from its base. Similarly Richards (2004) proposed that anti-human trafficking laws and regulations must include measures to get rid of these kinds of glitches in the threads of the legal system.

#### **(F) Role of NGOs in combating Human Trafficking**

The major findings from the interview of the NGO workers were a revelation that must be brought to the notice of every stakeholder. These findings came from the questions that were put forward to the workers at the NGO which is actively involved in anti-trafficking activities and those workers of CHILDLINE who work in collaboration with the NGO. The major **research questions** for the NGO workers were:

- What steps they took in order to curb human trafficking in their district?
- How do they go about the process in order to locate a missing girl or boy?
- What were the major barriers that they face while working against trafficking in persons (TIP) in the district?
- What major steps need to be taken in order to decrease the prevalence?
- What recommendations they think shall help the society at large, if formulated and implemented?

The answers to these questions were linked to each other. The answers to the first and second question were related to each other. It was seen that those people who were aware of CHILDLINE, would report the case of their missing ward (boy or girl) sooner or later. What generally happens is that they don't report until the time they keep getting any amount of money as a support from the earnings of their ward. Once the money stops coming, then they would report about their ward being missing. So generally a gap of 3-6 months is seen in most of the cases. The people in remote areas are generally informed by the Panchayat Raj Institution (PRI) members about CHILDLINE services. Other frontline service providers like NREGS workers, ASHA, Anganwadi workers, ANM are oriented and sensitized by the NGO who are functional in the blocks of Sundargarh district. The village people tell their superiors or the workers and service providers about their problems and thus are guided. In cases where they go to the police to report missing cases, they are misbehaved and ill treated. Most times, the cases are not lodged as FIRs (First Information Reports) instead they are put in the general diary (GD), which doesn't hold any accountability. In the case study interview, it was seen that whenever a person went missing due to trafficking, the parents or family or relatives would file a missing report at the CHILDLINE office. The search team of CHILDLINE would then try locating the missing person with the help of local police and the police at the destination region (state). On finding the missing person, the police at the destination region would then inform the police at the source region. The rescue operation then starts and then with the help of police personnel and CHILDLINE staff, the missing person is repatriated either to their families or relatives or to shelter homes. Though, none of the case study showed rehabilitation for these rescued victims.

The third question was about the barriers faced by the NGO workers while working against trafficking in the district. In the interview, the workers expressed their disappointment when they spoke of the barriers they faced. Their own lives and perception has changed over

the course of time while working for those who get trafficked and restoring back their lives and basic human rights. But that is not enough for their survival. These unprivileged people need cultural friendly and sustainable schemes to aid their sustenance.

- There is no awareness among the general mass about identifying the symptoms of trafficking and such vulnerable situations when they must act upon. People are not aware of their basic human rights, lest recognizing them is out of question in this context. It is not considered as an integral part of their lives or their accountability as a citizen of this country.
- Lack of support to the trafficked victims is another major setback they face. The people who get trafficked are not easily accepted back into their communities when they are repatriated after the rescue operation. The rehabilitation schemes designed by the state government do not function appropriately.
- The attitude of the district administration is not fair and rational towards the tribal people. Hence, they do not take immediate action for any reported case of girls or boys who go missing. The poor people are afraid of the bureaucratic system because of such behaviour. One simple example for this is would be; when a tribal man goes to the police station, he is seen waiting outside for long hours to be able to file a case for his or her missing ward or relative. Red tapism still continues to exist. There is lack of sensitivity in police behaviour.
- There is lack of data in this context due to the abovementioned behaviour of the district administration, which causes the reported cases to be limited. This is primarily because most cases go unreported.
- The increasing school dropout rate also renders increase in trafficking incidences.

- Orphaned people are vulnerable and so are those who have single parents. There is immense amount of social stigma in case of unwed mothers and their children. People with disabilities also fall into the vulnerable pocket, which eventually get trafficked.
- Lax border rules also contribute to the increasing propensity of trafficking incidences in Sundargarh. This is mainly because the traffickers operate from small villages where there is no police activity on a regular basis, lack of sensitization among the people in those communities and hence it means less risk for them. People are seen crossing borders but the police doesn't take strict action against them. The confusion between migration and trafficking is the chief cause for this kind of ambiguity.
- Very less number of traffickers are caught by the police. This doesn't let the circle break. Even when they get caught, they are bailed out and soon get back to business.
- The NGO workers mentioned about partial treatment from police and district administration. In rare cases, the tribal people are helped but only after a lot of lingering. The district labour office lacks personnel and resources are not properly utilized for keeping record of people who are migrating and of child labour status.

## CHAPTER IV

### CASE STUDIES

#### **4.1. A case of domestic servitude (Female)**

Kiran was born in a village in Sundergarh district, Odisha. She was born into a poverty stricken family. Her father was an alcoholic and her mother was falling sick frequently. By the year 2007, her mother breathed her last after delivering a girl child. In 2010, her father also died due to severe alcoholism. She was in the 4<sup>th</sup> grade in her village school when her mother died. Her younger sister was sent off to one of her distant relative's place, because there was no one else to take care of her. After her parent's demise, her uncle's got her elder sister married in 2012 June. Soon after her elder sister's marriage, she started getting visitors at her house, since she lived alone then. She used to feel threatened by their untimely visits. She had to cook for herself and the amount of food available was barely enough for her survival. She had very few friends in the village. She lived alone. After almost 10-15 days after her sister's wedding, her friend Sunita visited her. Sunita tried talking her into going out of the village for work. After having tried for a few times, Kiran finally gave into her repeated persuasion since she felt lonely at home. She had no source of income to support her studies further. So she decided to go with Sunita to New Delhi. The thought of going to a new metropolitan city caught her fancy. The picture that Sunita had shown her was very fascinating to Kiran. She was excited to go out of her village into a city to work. The pay was supposed to be handsome enough to support herself. She saw this as an opportunity of a lifetime. More so because it was her trusted village friend who made the offer to her. She was happy to go because she was promised that she would be given good work in a bungalow and that she would get to see the city too. After all, New Delhi is the country capital. Kiran was taken to New Delhi along with Sunita, three other girls and two of Sunita's uncles by train. After they reached New Delhi, Kiran was taken into a strange office which she found a

little intimidating. This was the placement agency. Within a span of two days, the placement agency prepared fake documents (apparently an affidavit) with her name and age changed. She was asked to sign on these documents. These documents were in English and Kiran did not know how to read in English. Later on when she learnt about the reality of these documents, she got to know that they had changed her name and age. At this time Kiran was hardly 14 years old. To avoid troubles later, the placement agency people had changed her age from that of a minor to that of a major.

After the completion of these formalities, Kiran was sent to a household in a good locality as a domestic help. She narrates “there were other few good looking girls who were sent to a hostel”. Here, by ‘hostel’ she meant a place where these girls were made to stay before they were employed. She was told that her monthly pay would be two thousand rupees. But this money was to be kept as a security amount at the placement agency until she finished her tenure of working at that household for one year. And some amount of her salary was to be paid to Sunita because she was the one who brought her along. Until this time Kiran did not know what exactly was going to happen to her dreams of working in New Delhi.

The house she was employed at had four members comprising a couple and their two little daughters. These girls went to school and the couple went to work in the day time while Kiran learnt cooking. Her job was to cook and clean. While Kiran was hoping that Sunita shall come by and meet her, it never happened. She couldn’t even communicate with her sister and brother in law over phone. She was not allowed to step out of the house. When she did not manage to cook well, she was scolded and left hungry for the rest of the day with extra work to do. She worked for about 5 months in this household. Thereafter Sunita visited her and took her back to the placement agency. The people at the placement agency told her that they would send her back to her house but she won’t be given any money that she had

earned so far. So they made a deal with her. She was told that if she worked for few more months in another household, she would be allowed to go back to her village along with her salary that she would earn till that time. Seeing no other way out of this whole mess, Kiran decided to stay back.

She was now sent to a household in a better locality than the previous one. This household had a couple (both working and a little more aged than the couple in the previous household) and a daughter and son. The daughter was in college and was kind to Kiran. In fact most of the people in this household were kind to her. They treated her well. They gave her good food to eat and clothes to wear. The daughter taught her Hindi because she did not know the language. So for better communication, she learnt Hindi. She worked in this household for about one year and three months. Sunita visited her around this time and said that she would help her go home very soon. But again she was sent to another household.

This was the last household Kiran worked at. They had a couple and a man who was a brother to the lady in the household. The couple went to work but the other man stayed all through the day in the house. Kiran wasn't treated well in this household. They would beat her for not being able to cook fine. Even if they have a washing machine, they would still make her wash clothes with her hand. Worse of all, the man staying in the house also sexually abused her from time to time. He would then threaten her with dire consequences if she ever tried telling this to his sister or brother in law. This went on for a while until when she decided to escape. This was the last straw. Every time there was a visitor, they would give her some paltry amount of money. She had saved up an amount of 500 rupees. One day in July 2012, when no one was around and while the old man was inside a room, she ran away. About 8 o'clock in the evening, she tried getting to the railway station to come back to her village. After having lost her way, she met a man who helped her by informing the local area police.

The police took her to the 'thana' as she described and gave her food. She was kept there for a day and half. Then she was taken to a shelter home named Nirmal Chaya. New Delhi police had informed the police of Sundergarh district by then. The district police took immediate action and tried to locate her family (sister and brother in law) with the help of CHILDLINE in Sundargarh. By the time her sister and brother in law got to know of her whereabouts 5 months had already passed. She stayed at the shelter home for about 5-6 months. The treatment at the shelter home was good and she had no work to do there. She was not used as a domestic labour. She was taken good care of. When she was brought back to Odisha, she was taken back to her family. Her sister and brother in law decided to keep Kiran with them.

Now Kiran stays with her sister and brother in law. She cooks while her sister goes to work as a maid. Her brother in law is a daily wage labourer. They have a little child who Kiran takes care of. When asked what she would like to do now, she says "I want to work in a safe place like a factory or a school near my village and come back home to my sister daily." She doesn't want to go out of her village to work anymore. She wants to finish her education, work and support herself financially.

New Delhi police had filed a 'suo moto' case at the Tees hazari court. The case was against the party (which included all the three employers who Kiran had worked for) who paid a compensation amounting to rupees one lakh and eighty thousand. Since these households were not paying the wage directly to her, all the money used to go to the placement agency. Thereafter the compensation was paid; the police made a Fixed Deposit account for Kiran and deposited all the compensation money. She also mentioned that right now she has a passbook of her own to manage her finances. There is no news of Sunita and the placement agency.

#### **4.2. A case of domestic servitude (Male)**

Shankar was trafficked when he was 13 years old. An aunty of his took him to New Delhi to work as a coolie in 2013 April. He belongs to a slum in the outskirts of Rourkela. After the demise of his father, his mother has been looking after him. She works as a maid servant (washing dishes) in a restaurant in Rourkela. Presently he works on a fast food stall assisting another man. Shankar's mother looks older for her age, because of extreme hard work and tedious labour. She works from 4am in the morning till 11pm in the night. That accounts for 16-19hours per day. Shankar is a playful young boy who would play around with boys of his slum. They could barely have two squares of meal a day. Sending Shankar to school is a farfetched dream for his mother. During the summers of 2013, one fine day, Shankar's aunt (not family related), Meera told him that he could work as a coolie in New Delhi. She said that this was a very good opportunity for him if he wanted to earn more money and buy good clothes and a fancy mobile phone. Considering the age he was in, all of these goodies were what he wanted. She lured him into this and took him away along with 5 other boys. They went to New Delhi by train and were accompanied by a man who they addressed as Uncle. This man had looks that scared them so they never asked him where exactly they were headed to. The first destination before going to New Delhi was a village nearby Rourkela. This was the village where Meera lived in.

After being taken to New Delhi he was directly taken to a house where he was kept as a domestic help. In this house his work was to clean, doing odd jobs and bringing groceries. He worked in this household for about 6 months. He had no freedom of talking or lest playing with the boys of that neighbourhood. He was beaten when he was found watching television. The food that was given to him was stale most times. His health started deteriorating. There was no medical supervision done on him. In the meanwhile, his mother here in Rourkela had informed CHILDLINE. She was helped by her employer who communicated with the

authorities at CHILDLINE. They informed the police at New Delhi to locate Shankar. They scanned for him and started a search. One day, Shankar spotted another boy who had accompanied him in the train to New Delhi. He found out that this boy was also working as a domestic help in a locality which was not very far from where Shankar was located at. Both of them decided to elope together. They looked for a nearby police station and decided to meet nearby on a weekend. The weekend came and Shankar for this new friend. But this boy never turned up. It so happened that, Shankar went to the police on his own and reported about his friend. Since he did not know where exactly he worked at. They couldn't immediately locate him. But Shankar was taken to an ashram school by the police and enrolled there. He stayed there for about 3 months. In the meanwhile, the police found out about his mother's whereabouts and informed her. It was not possible on her part to go all the way to New Delhi to get him because she hardly earned 130 rupees per day. Therefore, New Delhi police sent Shankar accompanied by 2 policemen to Rourkela. He was brought to the police station in Rourkela and handed back to his mother.

Even though Shankar managed to come back home to his mother, the other boys are still there in New Delhi. Shankar then found the job to work at the fast-food stall. His mother complains that he doesn't go to work regularly and simply idles away his time. He spends a lot of time gambling with his slum dweller friends. There are times she has to loan money to pay his debts. It is horrifying to see a boy of 15 years gambling and not living the life of an adolescent. Such involvement is spoiling his innocence too. Meera couldn't be tracked by the police of both the states because Shankar knew nothing of her whereabouts. When Sundargarh police went to her village, the people said that she had vacated her house and was gone forever.

### **4.3. A case of sex trafficking**

Anita was a girl from one of the villages in Sundargarh district. She belongs to a family where both the parents were diseased and they had no regular breadwinner. Some days they slept empty stomach and some days they had food. But they had no medical help at their disposal. Anita's father had tuberculosis and her mother had some disease which wasn't diagnosed properly. They didn't have enough money to bear the medical expenses. During this time Anita was 11 and half years old. And in these tribal regions, they did not rely on doctors or medical practitioners. So Anita's parents would seek help of the village people to get themselves treated. Her father was feeble old man and her mother was rather weak. Anita had to drop out of school for their pitiable economic condition. Her parents couldn't afford her studies anymore. Her brother also had to go to the fields to work as a labourer. He was 4 years elder to her.

Eventually Anita came in contact with one of her relatives who used to visit their house once in a while. He talked her into going with him to New Delhi. He said he would help her because she was capable of helping her parents. He told her about his work in New Delhi which paid him very well. Also he promised to take her there as a domestic help so she could work. He also told her that she would get good money to suffice her needs and also to send back home for her parent's treatment. She got baited and without informing her parents she went to New Delhi with this man named Sunil in 2009. Sunil took her to an area where there were shabby lodges and women on the street. Anita was too young to know what this place was all about. Sunil met some man in that area and handed over Anita to him. She was locked up in a room for 2 days without food. After two days Sunil came back with some documents and forcefully made Anita sign on them. From there she was taken to another house where there were many girls. Some looked like her age and some looked older. There were fair girls speaking alien language which she had no knowledge about. And there were

girls who looked like they were brought from a tribal village like theirs. They stood in queue according to some order which Anita couldn't comprehend. She was made to stand with the girls who seemed to have been brought from tribal areas like her. They were not fair skinned like others. Anita could only decipher that there was some differential treatment happening there. By the time she could understand things better, she was sold. Her uncle Sunil left her with those scary looking men. Initially she was undressed by a lady who checked her private parts. Then she was sexually abused every night. She was raped multiple times. She had to endure this treatment for more than a year. She had no escape out of that place. Every night she would get raped by one or more men. She had no one to talk to or go to. She had no pay and no medical treatment when she fell sick. Her sickness continued for a week or two when she finally fainted and a lady nurse was summoned. The nurse declared that Anita was pregnant. She was now 12 and half years old and she was pregnant. She did not know what the commotion was about. After 5 months of her pregnancy, she was taken to a deserted place (a bridge) and was thrown out of the vehicle. In those 5 months she was repeatedly raped and sexually abused. She got injured, knew nothing and had nowhere to go. She did not know Hindi very well to make a proper conversation with anyone.

After wandering for about 3 days without food, she was helped by an old woman who showed her the way to the railway station. The old woman told her that if she went to the railway station, she could get some food there if she would manage to beg and earn some. Anita followed instructions by instilling some faith in the old woman and headed for the railway station. She spent 5 nights at the railway station in a deserted corner when RPF (Railway Protection Force) personnel spotted her. Noticing that Anita was pregnant, he took her to the Railway Police Station. From there she was taken to the nearby Police station. The police officers sent her to a shelter home called Nari Niketan in Haryana because she was pregnant. They got her medically examined too. Having stayed at the shelter home for about

7 months, she was sent back home. During her stay there she delivered the baby. In the meanwhile, a worker from an NGO based in Haryana itself got this news. He tried to contact the police authority of Odisha. By the time this news reached CHILDLINE, three months had passed. With a lot of difficulties Anita was finally traced because she did not know where she was and what she was supposed to do. Almost two years had passed by now. Anita was 14 years old when she returned back to Odisha. Child Welfare Committee (CWC), Sundargarh was informed about this matter. They made all the arrangements for Anita's return. She came back to Rourkela accompanied by Haryana police personnel and the NGO worker in December 2011. Later she was handed over to CHILDLINE along with her 2 months old baby. CHILDLINE then produced the baby and Anita before the CWC (Child Welfare Committee) where she said that she didn't want to keep the baby. She did not know who this baby belonged to. She told them everything that had happened with her. CHILDLINE filed a case in the name of Sunil (the trafficker) at the local police station. Anita's parents were summoned and were eager to take her back. But they had a condition that they would not let her take the baby along. So they surrendered the baby to CWC who was later sent to the Specialized Adoption Agency with an intention that the baby can be given for adoption there.

When Anita went back to her village with her parents, she was treated with utmost care. Later when the villagers learnt that she came back pregnant from New Delhi, they wanted her removed from the village itself. After a lot of drama over this, Anita was sent off to her distant relative's home to look after their kids and do the household errands so as to spare her the mental turmoil. She already had had too much at this tender age. She went through hell. Since this was a case of sex trafficking, Anita was not taken to the shelter home in Sundargarh. They refused to take her to avoid complications.

#### **4.4. A case of group trafficking**

This is a case of group trafficking. For this study only one of those girls could be contacted. Due to the time limitation other girls couldn't be located. Five girls from a tribal village of Sundargarh district were lured into fleeing to New Delhi with a middleman. This man got hold of these girls who were friends with each other through an agent named Rakhi. Rakhi was a village woman who helped the middleman in supplying girls for his racket. There were five girls. All of them were minors and were school dropouts. They assisted their parents in their agricultural works and also went to the nearby forests to collect minor forest products for their daily survival. Abject poverty and scarcity ruled their lives. Some of their parents' were daily wage workers and labourers. Some were sick and some dead.

According to Rakhi these girls were vulnerable and an easy target. After some persuasion and having shown them false dreams, these girls decided to flee together. They were told that they would get to live the lavish lifestyles of a city like New Delhi. This fancied them and they were ready to leave together. So they devised a plan to flee together. They packed their clothes and told their parents that they were going to the nearby village to attend one of their friend's wedding. They met the middleman and Rakhi outside the village. From there Rakhi took them to a house in deserted area after having crossed few villages. The girls spent one night there. These girls were happy and excited due to the allurements made. But they surely were unaware of the consequences that lay ahead of them. Meanwhile one of the parents got worried and suspected foul play. He enquired from one of the friends of these girls. After getting a hint that they have fled, he immediately went to the town nearby and informed the CHILDLINE officials. He was informed about the rescue operations of CHILDLINE through one of the villagers. These officials immediately got into action and sent search teams. Public places like bus stops, railway station, and auto-rickshaw stops were searched. Meanwhile one of the search team members spotted 5 girls together sitting

inside an auto-rickshaw with a lady besides them. There was man on motorcycle with no number plate on it. He standing besides the auto-rickshaw and was talking to the rickshaw driver. When the search team member asked where these girls were headed, the man on the motorcycle replied “I am taking them as labourers to Nagpur and they have come on their own will.” The search team member suspected foul play and immediately informed CHILDLINE. Within few minutes police personnel and CHILDLINE officials reached the spot and rescued the five girls who were about to get trafficked. In the meanwhile, Rakhi fled along with the auto rickshaw driver. These people with the help of police personnel captured the middleman who turned out to be the son of an editor of a reputed newspaper agency. Initially police officials were hesitant about arresting this man. But on the consistent pressure built up by the CHILDLINE officials, they were forced to arrest him and also forwarded him to the court for further judicial process. The bail petition that was filed by the man’s father was also rejected by the court. Due to his influential position he tried to threaten the CHILDLINE officials and the police personnel too. These girls were also sent for medical check up and it was confirmed that they were minors. This strengthened the case against the middleman.

Later these girls were sent back to their families in the village. Their parents and some other villagers talked to the officials for starting rehabilitation process by setting up units where their daughters could work and earn some money. When asked the Gita suggested on her own that activities like poultry farming, rearing goats and milking cows could help them earn their livelihood. She also mentioned that her parents and the villagers has requested for some monetary support to start these units and for their training purpose. This was to be meant for all the village girls who were vulnerable like their daughters. This was with an intention to get an alternate source of earning their livelihood. Ever since the discussion,

nothing has been done by the government she says. Gita looks forward to work and earn for herself and her family. The case against the middleman is still on.

#### **4.5 A case of Transnational Trafficking**

This is a case of transnational human trafficking. A minor girl from one of our neighboring country was trafficked through international waterways and land route into India for the purpose of being sold into flesh trade. She was supposed to be taken to Gujarat for this purpose in the pretext of being employed in a textile industry, with a handsome pay scale of Rs.10, 000 per month. The agents who trafficked her out of her district had first tried to convince her parents to allow her to work during her summer vacations. She was in her 10<sup>th</sup> grade before she got trafficked. When her father did not accept the offer, the agents (a man and a woman from their neighboring village) directly contacted her. She saw the benefit of stepping out of home for such an amount and agreed to come along with them without informing her parents or her brother. Her journey started when she was brought by boat to India and then by road to Howrah, which was followed by railway route to Gujarat. During the train journey she learnt that she was going to be sold off into the flesh trade in Gujarat. That is when she started crying and attracted attention from co-passengers. They learnt the story from her and nabbed the agents. While crossing Rourkela railway station, they got off to inform the police. The police personnel arrested the agents and rescued the girl. Later they informed CHILDLINE about this. The CHILDLINE staff immediately took action and rehabilitated her at the Open Shelter managed by the local NGO DISHA and CHILDLINE at Bisra. After a lot of counseling and assurance she gave her parent's phone number to get in contact with. CHILDLINE officials have already informed her parents and also UNICEF Odisha to take necessary action to send her back to her home country. She is in a state of trauma presently to give any more details.

## CHAPTER V

### DISCUSSIONS AND CONCLUSION

Human trafficking is a concern for the development professionals. To address trafficking in persons, a need and rights-based approach is required. This issue is complex as it encompasses socio-economic and political aspects of a social system. The major findings of this study are:

There is a large gap to be bridged between the laws existing and the laws being implemented. The traffickers are not being convicted according to the actual number of people being trafficked. Due to dearth of resources for the law enforcement officers, this gap exists. The mandates available or provisioned are not enough to curb trafficking. Odisha as a state lacks victim protection laws, regulations and policies. The shelter homes and short stay homes existing do not function well, so they should be monitored. The partial behaviour of the district administration towards the local NGOs and the tribal people does not solve the problem rather it worsens it. Police personnel and law enforcement officials lack the belief that child trafficking and trafficking in person is a serious crime. They lack sensitization and awareness. The sense of duty for the public should be instilled in the minds of every stakeholder. Dysfunctional rehabilitation measures are a failure. Not much importance is given to the issue of human trafficking in this industrial district, when it is being addressed at the state level. There is no rehabilitation scheme for the males who get trafficked. That is a major setback.

In the year 2013, Integrated Anti-Human Trafficking Unit was established under the Ministry of Women and Child Development. Its primary goal is to detect, prevent trafficking as well as rescue and rehabilitate those who have been trafficked. Bringing the convict under the books of law is one of the goals of the Integrated Anti-Human Trafficking unit and making it a speedy procedure is also an integral part of this.

## 5.1 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

There are several limitations of the study.

- The number of case study was taken as 5 because it was very difficult to trace and locate the respondents (rescued victims). There were alarming hindrances while pursuing this unexplored territory of a clandestine action like trafficking.
- This was a case about rescued victims and none were found in rescue homes or the rehabilitation centres. Those women and girls who were rescued in the last few months were sent back to their homes. This made the task all the more challenging.
- When locating the respondents became very difficult, the help of NGO workers' was taken who worked actively in the anti-trafficking movement and also rescued those who were trafficked.
- During the pilot study it was observed that the respondents were not very comfortable revealing about what happened to them. During the actual interview, it was a very tough task asking them the questions which were very sensitive for them. So proper care was taken while articulating the questions.
- Fear and doubts hovered over their minds. It was very difficult to build rapport with them.
- Appropriate measures were taken to keep their identity and location anonymous. It was extremely difficult to coax them to give relevant information.
- The questionnaire was semi structured and had open ended questions so that they don't feel that the information which they reveal is being recorded in any manner.
- Several times, the interviews were rescheduled, repeated, pre-poned and post-poned. Some of the respondents were not okay being visited at their residences, so they were summoned to the CHILDLINE office for the interview.

- At times, there were clashes between the venue and timings which did not match. There were several emotional breakdowns, which were a pathetic thing to behold.
- One of the girls wanted to speak all alone with no male member of the NGO or CHILDLINE around as a sense of security, even though they were harmless.
- Convincing them that this study would benefit them in a subtle manner was a herculean task. They gave the interviews relying on this aspect.

## **5.2 IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY**

By the help of this study, it can be marked that immense priority should be given resource allocation for those nodal agencies, NGOs, civil societies and governmental bodies who are involved in anti-trafficking activities in Sundargarh district. Researchers can seek insight from this study about what number of respondents or sample size they should have in future studies or surveys. Creating sustainable employment opportunities for the tribal girls in or around their villages is very necessary so that the prevalence can be reduced. Policy makers must keep this in mind. Social workers can benefit from this study by helping trafficked people in the process of capacity building so that they can have access to better services in their own region. Above all, social workers are a ray of hope for the marginalised sections of our country. Their contribution towards alleviating poverty, removing disparities, increasing access to basics needs makes them accountable to these sections of the society.

## **5.3 DIRECTION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH**

Including every stake holders (service providers and survivors of trafficking) in the sensitization programs, awareness building programs and decision making process will be an inclusive approach. When any such study shall be undertaken then, the time factor must be kept in mind so that it covers all the stakeholders. In case of case studies, at least 20-50 respondents must be considered. Police personnel should also be included as respondents along with judicial officers, labour department officials, NGO workers. Along with this, the

officials of state mechanisms for rehabilitation should be included. To get a concrete idea about the real scenario, every tribe of the state must be included in similar studies in future. All the vulnerable pockets of the district must have socio-legal camps to create awareness among them. This is necessary for the people from such areas to identify the reasons that make them vulnerable and prone to fall prey to such criminal rackets. Fund allocation must be done properly. Above all, women participation must be encouraged as respondents in such studies. Their input is as important and relevant as that of their male counterparts. And more research should be undertaken so that correct data from the field can be collected. This shall help to design appropriate methods to curb human trafficking in Sundargarh. It is very vital for every researcher to keep in mind one important thing i.e., to leave behind his/her fear and myth when going to the field for survey. Because my personal experience says that, it is not unsafe to work in the field provided we stick to the ethical considerations and build genuine rapport with the respondents and the stakeholders. Understanding the backgrounds of the respondents helps a great deal in studying this phenomenon in a better and exploratory way.

#### **5.4 RECOMMENDATIONS**

To prevent human trafficking awareness creating activities must be undertaken by nongovernmental and governmental bodies working in all the blocks of the district. Inclusion of women in Gram Sabha meetings and planning sessions is very vital. Creating alternative livelihood opportunities is important for the tribal girls. This shall be helpful in diminishing the levels of trafficking prevalence in the district. Only these opportunities would not help. So training these girls to make sustainable utility products is very important to ensure stability. Including people from every kind of background in the meetings and planning's of the Gram Sabha shall help to facilitate inclusive approach towards growth. The front line service providers should be sensitized and be trained to not favour people of higher castes or discriminate any from the lower castes. The grass root workers (ANM, ASHA, and

Anganwadi) should be oriented and trained properly. Good resource is required for this, thus the allocation and utilization of resource is very vital. The trainers must be efficient, well trained and should have clarity over their subject matter, should carry relevant, and important information with themselves so as to impart it to the workers. Legal reforms like having a women and child desk at every police station is a necessity nowadays. These officials should be well trained and in cases of transfer, immediate replacement should be looked into.

After having studied the limitations and the shortcomings in this study and also in the field, I have designed a rough plan in a suggestive manner to be incorporated in the policies and for supporting information for further studies. This should be able to help future researchers to understand the ground realities better.

Making a committee at the village level consisting of health workers, PRI workers, school teachers and staff, NGO workers, forest department workers and staff, Anganwadi workers and block officials from the NREGA scheme to keep the list of:

- children in the village (should consist of 50 households or more)
- the number of children going to school and the number who don't attend school
- rough details of children who don't go to school so as to know where else they go to at that hour
- number of children who have parents
- number of children who are orphans
- economic condition of the children
- the schemes that the children avail and those which they don't
- all schemes that are available for the children to avail (SSA- Sarva Shikshya Abhiyan, Indira Awas Yojna, Antodaya, Arnapurna)
- ensure that the children and their families avail these schemes that they are entitled to

- record of address of those who have migrated out of their village or have been trafficked

One such convergence measure should be able to solve at least half the problems that are faced by those who are working to curb and combat human trafficking.

Vulnerability mapping should become a mandate to identify the pockets which are more vulnerable. The major issues prevailing in these pockets should also be identified and then measures should be devised to tackle these issues. Educating the people about their rights and thus empowering them is the need of the hour.

## REFERENCES

- American Psychological Association, Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls. (2014). *Report of the Task Force on Trafficking of Women and Girls*. Retrieved from <http://www.apa.org/pi/women/programs/trafficking/report.aspx>
- Aronowitz, A. A. (2009). *Human trafficking, human misery: the global trade in human beings*. Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Bales, K. (2007). What predicts human trafficking? *International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice*, 31(2), 269-279.
- Basu, A. K., & Chau, N. H. (2004). *Exploitation of child labour and the dynamics of debt bondage*. *Journal of Economic Growth*, 9(2), 209-238.
- Bohl, K. (2010). *Human trafficking as a livelihood strategy? (Doctoral dissertation, Master Thesis in Culture)*.
- Census. (2011). Retrieved from <http://www.census2011.co.in/census/district/398-sundargarh.html>
- CIF (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.childlineindia.org.in/child-trafficking-india.htm>
- Dinh, N., Hughes, C., Hughes, J. W., & Maurer-Fazio, M. (2014). *Human Trafficking in Southeast Asia: Results from a Pilot Project in Vietnam*. Available at SSRN 2528778.
- Doezema, J. (2002). *Who gets to choose? Coercion, consent, and the UN Trafficking Protocol*. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 20-27.
- Fowler, J., & UNICEF. (2004). *Human Trafficking in Africa Fuelled by War, Economic Hardship, and Lack of Birth Registration*.
- Friebel, Guido & Sergei Guriev. (2004). "Smuggling Humans: A Theory of Debt Financed Migration", *Discussion Paper, 1025, IZA, Bonn, Germany*.
- Gallagher, A. (2001). Human rights and the new UN protocols on trafficking and migrant smuggling: A preliminary analysis. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 23(4), 975-1004.

- Getu, M. (2006). *Human trafficking and development: The role of microfinance. Transformation, 23(3), 142-156.*
- Ghosh, B. (2009). Trafficking in women and children in India: nature, dimensions and strategies for prevention. *The International Journal of Human Rights, 13(5), 716-738.*
- Gupta, J., Reed, E., Kershaw, T., & Blankenship, K. M. (2011). *History of sex trafficking, recent experiences of violence, and HIV vulnerability among female sex workers in coastal Andhra Pradesh, India. International Journal of Gynecology & Obstetrics, 114(2), 101-105.*
- Hameeda, S., Hlatshwayo, S., Tanner, E., Turker, M., & Yang, J. (2010). *Human Trafficking in India: Dynamic, Current Efforts, and Intervention Opportunities for the Asia Foundation. Report by Stanford University for the Asia Foundation.*
- Huda, S. (2006). *Sex trafficking in South Asia. International journal of gynaecology & obstetrics, 94(3), 374-381.*
- ILO, A. (2005). *Global Alliance against Forced Labour. ILO, Geneva.*
- Iselin, B., & Adams, M. (2003). Distinguishing between human trafficking and people smuggling. *UN Office on Drugs and Crime, Regional Centre for East Asia and the Pacific, Bangkok, 10.*
- Kangaspunta, K. (2011). Trafficking in persons. *Routledge Handbook of Criminology, 178.*
- Kligman, G., & Limoncelli, S. (2005). *Trafficking women after socialism: From, to, and through Eastern Europe. Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society, 12(1), 118-140.*
- Kyle, D., & Koslowski, R. (Eds.). (2011). *Global human smuggling: Comparative perspectives.* JHU Press.
- Miko, F. T., & Park, G. (2003, March). *Trafficking in women and children: The US and international response. Congressional Research Service, Library of Congress.*

- Nair, P. M., & Sen, S. (2005). *Trafficking in women and children in India*. Orient Blackswan.
- Orhant, M., & Murphy, E. (2002). Trafficking in Persons. *Reproductive Health and Rights: Reaching the Hardly Reached*. Washington, DC: PATH.
- Panda, S. M. (2013). 5 Exploring mobile livelihoods among tribal communities in Odisha, India. *Gender, Mobilities and Livelihood Transformations: Comparing Indigenous People in China, India and Laos: Comparing Indigenous People in China, India, and Laos*, 93.
- Richards, K. (2004). The trafficking of migrant workers: what are the links between labour trafficking and corruption? *International Migration*, 42(5), 147-168.
- Richards, K. (2004). The trafficking of migrant workers: what are the links between labour trafficking and corruption? *International Migration*, 42(5), 147-168.
- Salt, J. (2000). Trafficking and human smuggling: A European perspective. *International Migration*, 38(3), 31-56.
- Shelley, L. (2007). Human trafficking as a form of transnational crime. *Human trafficking*, 116-137.
- Shetty, J. (2012). *Loss of tribal land and displacement: Impact on women*. *Afro Asian Journal of Anthropology and Social Policy*, 3(2), 71-79.
- Skeldon, R. (2000). *Trafficking: a perspective from Asia*. *International migration*, 38(3), 7-30.
- Tumlin, K. C. (2000). *Trafficking in children and women: A regional overview*. ILO.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (n.d.). *Human Trafficking*. Accessed on 5<sup>th</sup> February, 2015 from <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html?ref=menu>
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, Chawla, S., Me, A., & Le Pichon, T. (2009).

*Global Report on Trafficking in Persons: Human Trafficking a Crime that Shames Us All.*

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime.

United Nations. (2000) Retrieved from

<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/ProtocolTraffickingInPersons.aspx>. Accessed on 12.03.2015

Van Impe, K. (2000). *People for sale: The need for a multidisciplinary approach towards human trafficking*. *International Migration*, 38(3), 113-191.

Väyrynen, R. (2003). *Illegal immigration, human trafficking, and organized crime* (No. 2003/72). WIDER Discussion Papers/World Institute for Development Economics (UNU-WIDER).

Wheaton, E. M., Schauer, E. J., & Galli, T. V. (2010). Economics of human trafficking. *International Migration*, 48(4), 114-141.

## QUESTIONNAIRE FOR RESCUED VICTIM

1. Tell me about your journey from here to the destination.
2. Tell me about:
  - Your life and experience there
  - Your living and food condition.
  - The placement agencies (selection criteria, number of girls there, about the pay)
  - Your future plans (If given an opportunity, would you want to go outside this environment?, what would you like to do?, what kind of work would you like to do?)
3. Did you have a scope of return or escape from the destination or transit region? What was the behaviour of family and community after the rescue operation?
4. The police intervention and police behaviour (at both the places- source and destination)

## **QUESTIONNAIRE FOR NGO WORKERS**

1. What steps they took in order to curb human trafficking in their district?
2. How do they go about the process in order to locate a missing girl or boy?
3. What were the major barriers that they face while working against trafficking in persons (TIP) in the district?
4. What major steps need to be taken in order to decrease the prevalence?
5. What recommendations they think shall help the society at large, if formulated and implemented?